



Alternatives Public Meeting #2 August 9, 2016

Advantages and Disadvantages

	ADVANTAGES	DISADVANTAGES
No Build/Repair <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Install cathodic protection pile jackets Repair the fender system Upgrade drawbridge electrical system Repair concrete (sealing cracks, patching spalls, etc.) in the piles, pile caps, deck, beams, and traffic railing Repair the drawbridge operational machinery Replace the beams, deck, and traffic railing on 6 of the fixed spans Repair and paint drawbridge steel Install 10 crutch bents Requires 9-week bridge closure 10-year service life 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> No acquisition of right-of-way or submerged land easements Lowest initial cost compared to all other alternatives No impacts to utilities No height restrictions for boats No mangrove and seagrass impacts 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Nine-week bridge closure and detour via Anna Maria Bridge (12 miles, 23 mins) and Ringling Bridge (32 miles, 53 mins) A short service life (10 years), then replacement is needed Bridge will continue to be functionally obsolete for the life of the structure (i.e. no shoulders, not designed to current structural and safety standards) Continued and increasing operation, maintenance, and repair costs Continued safety concerns associated with the raised curb and lack of adequate shoulders Continued safety concerns associated with the substandard traffic railings Continued safety concerns associated with vessels impacting the piles Continued concern for effective and reliable hurricane evacuation and recovery should mechanical systems malfunction or vehicles become disabled, blocking the through lane No improvement in water quality in Anna Maria Sound/Sarasota Bay since stormwater will not be treated Continued vehicular delay caused by the drawbridge openings Continued delay as vessels wait for bridge to open Continued vulnerability of the bridge to wave action in severe storms No benefit of additional 10 foot horizontal clearance between fenders Repairs would not prevent the need to post the bridge for weight restrictions, meaning that heavy trucks could be restricted No aesthetic improvements
Replacement - Low-Level Drawbridge <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Replace existing drawbridge with new drawbridge providing 21-ft of vertical clearance, 10-ft sidewalks, 10-ft shoulders, and 7-ft buffered bike lanes 75-year service life 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> No height restrictions for boats Maximum grade of 4% does not require flat landings per Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA). Improvement in water quality in Anna Maria Sound/Sarasota Bay due to treatment of stormwater runoff Improved safety and functional adequacy of bridge due to added shoulders, a wider sidewalk, a crash tested barrier, and increased resistance to ship impact and storm surge Increased horizontal distance between fenders will accommodate safer navigation 10-ft sidewalks are an improvement over the existing sidewalks and accommodate multiple users, including pedestrians, fishermen, bicyclists, and other recreational users Similar visual impacts relative to existing bridge height Similar grades for pedestrians to cross bridge relative to existing bridge grades Similar visual impacts relative to existing bridge height Long Service Life (75 years) Traffic can use existing bridge while replacement is being constructed No restrictions for heavy trucks 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Continued vehicular delay caused by the drawbridge openings Continued delay as vessels wait for draw bridge to open Effects on the natural environment Continued operating costs due to the need for a bridge tender Requires acquisition of submerged land easement Minor mangrove and seagrass impacts Utility impacts Requires additional right-of-way for ponds Requires additional submerged lands easement
Replacement - Mid-Level Drawbridge <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Replace existing drawbridge with new drawbridge providing 35-ft of vertical clearance, 10-ft sidewalks, 10-ft shoulders, and 7-ft buffered bike lanes 75-year service life 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> No height restrictions for boats Reduced traffic delays due to fewer drawbridge openings Improvement in water quality in Anna Maria Sound due to treatment of stormwater runoff Improved safety and functional adequacy of bridge due to added shoulders, a wider sidewalk, a crash tested barrier, and increased resistance to ship impact and storm surge Increased horizontal distance between fenders will accommodate safer navigation Maximum grade of 4.5% does not require flat landings per Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA). The 35-ft navigation height will allow one third (33%) of the boats that currently require the bridge to open to pass under the closed bridge 10-ft sidewalks are an improvement over the existing sidewalks and accommodate multiple users, including pedestrians, fishermen, bicyclists, and other recreational users Long Service Life (75 years) Traffic can use existing bridge while replacement is being constructed No restrictions for heavy trucks 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Continued vehicular delay caused by the drawbridge openings, though fewer openings than today Continued delay as vessels wait for draw bridge to open; though fewer openings than today Continued operating costs due to the need for a bridge tender Greater visual impacts relative to the existing bridge height Effects on the natural environment Steeper grades for pedestrians to cross bridge relative to existing bridge grades, but still meets ADA standards Requires acquisition of submerged land easement for fenders Minor mangrove and seagrass impacts Utility impacts Requires additional right-of-way for ponds Requires additional submerged lands easement
Replacement - High-Level Fixed Bridge <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Replace existing drawbridge with new fixed bridge providing 65-ft of vertical clearance, 10-ft sidewalks, 10-ft shoulders, and 7-ft buffered bike lanes 75-year service life 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Improvement in water quality in Anna Maria Sound due to treatment of stormwater runoff No operating costs since no bridge tender is required Significant operational improvements and no vehicular delay from drawbridge openings Improved safety and functional adequacy of the bridge due to added shoulders, a wider sidewalk, a crash tested barrier, and increased resistance to ship impact and storm surge 10-ft sidewalks are an improvement over the existing sidewalks and accommodate multiple users, including pedestrians, fishermen, bicyclists, and other recreational users Increased horizontal distance between the fenders will accommodate safer navigation Maximum grade of 5% does not require flat landings per Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA). Long Service Life (75 years) Traffic can use existing bridge while replacement is being constructed No restrictions for heavy trucks 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 65-ft bridge height will not allow 2% of current boat traffic under bridge Effects on the natural environment Greater visual impacts relative to the existing bridge height Steeper grades for pedestrians to cross bridge relative to existing bridge grades, but still meets ADA standards Additional ROW is required to maintain access to a residential parcel east of 127th Street West (North Alignment Only) Access changes required on east end of bridge <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Realignment of 127th Street West to the east SR 684 (Cortez Road) passing over the existing 127th Street West. Two local driveways relocated from Cortez Road to 127th Street West Direct access to Central Avenue from SR 684 (Cortez Road) cut off Requires acquisition of submerged land easement for fenders Minor mangrove and seagrass impacts Utility impacts Requires additional right-of-way for ponds Requires additional submerged lands easement